

Division of Program Coordination, Planning, and Strategic Initiatives
Office of the Director, National Institutes of Health
Draft Meeting Minutes Council of Councils Working Group Meeting

Lincoln Park Zoo, Chicago, IL

8:00 AM – 5:00 PM, Wednesday, 1 August 2012

Working Group Participants: Daniel Geschwind, Beatrice Hahn, K.C. Kent Lloyd, Daniel J. Povinelli, Stephen Ross, and Patricia Turner

NIH Staff: James M. Anderson, Lora Kutkat, and Betina Orezzaoli

The National Institutes of Health (NIH) Council of Councils Working Group on the Use of Chimpanzees in NIH-Supported Research held a meeting on 1 August 2012 as part of their ongoing efforts to provide advice/recommendations to the Council on 1) implementation of the guiding principles and criteria of the Institute of Medicine (IOM) Report, “Chimpanzees in Biomedical and Behavioral Research: Assessing the Necessity” and 2) the size and placement of the research active and inactive populations of NIH-owned or -supported chimpanzees.

Tour of the Zoo Facilities

The Working Group members toured the Lincoln Park Zoo facility.

Welcome, Conflict of Interest and Confidentiality Agreement (Co-chairs, NIH)

Drs. Anderson, Geschwind, and Lloyd greeted the participants, and welcomed them to the meeting. Dr. Geschwind and Lloyd gave a brief overview of the agenda.

Ms. Kutkat reminded the participants of the Confidentiality and Non-Disclosure agreements that are in effect. She requested that the participants should leave the discussions if they had a Conflict of Interest with any issues/proposals discussed, and could re-join the meeting once they were notified.

Discussion and Approval of May and July 2012 Draft Meeting Minutes (Co-chairs)

- The July 2012 meeting minutes were unanimously approved.
- The May 2012 meeting minutes were unanimously approved.

Report of Sub-Group Activities, Next Steps (Co-chairs)

The colony management sub-groups will meet on 2 August 2012 to discuss their tasks. Dr. Geschwind requested the Working Group members to consider the topics that will be included in the final report to the Council during their discussion. (The Working Group has developed a draft outline of the report.)

- The progress of the Working Group toward accomplishing its goal.

Dr. Anderson advised the Working Group to meet, as needed, to accomplish their tasks before the Council of Councils meeting on 5 September. He outlined the tasks for the 5 September Council of Councils Meeting:

- Present an outline of the topics to be discussed in the final report to the Council.
- Present the awarded projects recommendations.
- Present a summary of the Working Group's activities (e.g., field trips) and progress.
- If possible, present options for the review process to be used in assessing new or competing extramural applications, intramural proposals, contracts and 3rd party proposals.

Process Review (members: Ms. Charo [not present] and Drs. Barrett [not present] and Povinelli) **and Implementation** (members: Ms. Charo [not present] and Drs. Turner and Ross)

Points to Consider: Current NIH Review Procedures (NIH)

Dr. Anderson presented that the IOM recommendation regarding the establishment of “an independent Oversight Committee that builds on the Interagency Animal Model Committee (IAMC)” for the review of research proposals involving chimpanzees would result in the introduction of an additional review component to the currently extant review process at the NIH. He gave an overview of the current NIH review process.

The Working Group identified the several key issues to consider during the development of an additional review component recommendation to the NIH, such as:

- Proposals come in through different pathways (e.g., contracts, intramural research)
- At what point in the current NIH review process should the review component conducted by an Oversight Committee occur?
- The composition of the Oversight Committee, and the process of educating them about IOM's recommendations
- Should the investigators planning to use chimpanzees in their research be asked to provide an additional document/form that specifically addresses the IOM's criteria?
- Since some categories of research were seen as exempt by the IOM committee, these categories of research should likely be exempted from the additional review step by the Oversight Committee (e.g., behavioral/observational research involving wild populations, stored samples, samples from wild and/or captive populations without interventions/interactions, postmortem samples)?
- How could a decision tree be structured to facilitate the additional review component?
- The Working Group could propose interim recommendations and recommend that NIH pilot them within the current review process. After a predetermined period of time, the process could be finalized based on comments from the research community and NIH staff.

Decision Tree Model

A draft Decision Tree model is in development.

Colony Management (members: Drs. Hahn, Ross, Povinelli, and Turner)

During the subgroup meeting (following day), the members will discuss and outline the preliminary characteristics of ethologically appropriate housing for chimpanzees and consider options for size and placement of chimpanzee colonies for research.

Final Review of Awarded Projects (Co-chairs)

Ms. Kutkat reminded the Working Group of the recusal procedures and conflicts of interest. Projects were reviewed.

Working Group Report Outline (Co-chairs)

The outline of the forthcoming report was briefly discussed. The Co-chairs and the Working Group members will provide input and add to the document.

Planning for the 5 September Council of Councils Meeting (Co-chairs)

For the 5 September meeting, the Working Group will:

- Present an overview of the Working Group members/their area(s) of expertise.
- Present the progress/accomplishments of the Group to date.
- Present awarded project recommendations in closed session.
- Present an outline of the topics to be discussed in the final report to the Council.

Planning for Next Field Trips

The Working Group members suggested the following facilities for potential field trips:

- Save the Chimps Primate Sanctuary, FL
- Bastrop, TX